Nostalgia and Poetry: Reflections on Research, Creative Expression, and Fieldwork Across Borders

Maki Motapanyane is Assistant Professor of Women's Studies at Mount Royal University. She has published in the areas of feminist theory and methodology, and cultural studies. Current research examines resettlement and citizenship among immigrant and refugee women in Canada. She is the editor of Mothering in Hip-Hop Culture: Representation and Experience (Demeter Press, 2012).

Abstract
This paper takes an interdisciplinary theoretical approach to methodological considerations of insider/outsider status in the context of transnational research projects. The focus is on expatriate nostalgia in relation to feminist research. Poetry, in the form of fieldwork journal, is presented as a productive outlet for nostalgia—a method of feminist self-reflexivity that can strengthen the researcher's critical intuition, clarify standpoint and interpretive approach, and mediate the condition of multiple belonging. In the context of fieldwork conducted in South Africa in affiliation with a Canadian university, expatriate nostalgia is examined as a neglected area of feminist methodological inquiry. The paper further considers the productive potential of creative expression to the process of negotiating identity, dissecting power relations, and transcending dichotomous understandings of insider/outsider status in the context of academic research.

Résumé
Cet article apporte une approche théorique interdisciplinaire aux considérations méthodologiques du statut de « citoyen/étranger » dans le contexte des projets de recherche transnationaux. Il se concentre sur la nostalgie de l’expatrié/e en relation avec la recherche féministe. La poésie, sous forme de registre de travail sur le terrain, est présentée comme un moyen d’expression productif pour la nostalgie—une méthode d’autoréflexivité féministe qui peut renforcer l’intuition critique du chercheur/de la chercheuse, clarifier le point de vue et l’approche d’interprétation, et servir d’intermédiaire lorsque l’on se trouve dans une situation d’appartenances multiples. Dans le contexte de travail sur le terrain effectué en Afrique du Sud, en affiliation avec une université canadienne, la nostalgie de l’expatrié/e demeure un domaine négligé, en ce qui a trait aux enquêtes méthodologiques féministes. Cet article considère davantage le potentiel productif de l’expression créatrice, au processus de négociation de l’identité, disséquer les relations de pouvoir, et transcender les compréhensions dichotomiques du statut « citoyen/étranger » dans le contexte de la recherche académique.
the process of negotiating identity, dissecting power dynamics, and transcending dichotomous understandings of insider/outsider status in the context of academic research.

This discussion departs somewhat from more common feminist assessments of insider/outsider status that have tended to focus primarily on questions of researcher positionality (Merriam et al. 2001), power relations, sameness and difference, trust, silencing, practices of exclusion, and exploitation as revealed in the relationships of researchers to their subjects of study (DeVault 1996). The focus here is on insider/outside researcher experience in the context of exile trauma, or what may be referred to as immigrant nostalgia. Excerpts from a journal of poetry composed alongside archival research and fieldwork in South Africa during the summer of 2008 are presented as symptomatic of this nostalgia. The role of poetry is considered as part of a holistic intellectual exercise that enables critical assessment of the process of negotiating identity between different geographic homes.

Two methodological paths of inquiry influence this discussion. The first is feminist scholarship on self-reflexivity (England 1994; Naples and Sachs 2000; Wasserfall 1993), research across difference (Kirsch 1999; Temple and Edwards 2002), and insider/outside status (Collins 1991; Mullings 1999), where feminist scholars have analyzed “how the production of ethnographic knowledge is shaped by the shifting, contextual, and relational contours of the researcher’s social identity and her social situatedness or positionality, (in terms of gender, race, class, sexuality and other axes of social difference), with respect to her subjects” (Nagar and Geiger 2007). Second, my reflection is influenced by methodology scholarship on arts-based research (Eisner 2006; Finley 2003; Knowles and Cole 2007; Sinner, Leggo, Irwin, Gouzousias and Grauer 2006). In this latter grouping, I have consulted literature that specifically examines the role of poetry in qualitative research (De Beer 2003; Percer 2002; Saunders 2003). This scholarship largely addresses the benefits of expanding the platform of authorial styles and voices in academic writing, and of narrative and poetry as forms of data representation, as well as the interpretive benefits of poetry as a form of data analysis. In this paper, I discuss poetry as an auxiliary fieldwork device akin to the fieldwork journal, rather than a means of data presentation.

Though feminist methodology encourages depth in self-reflexivity, not all aspects of the self-reflexive process are appropriate for inclusion in the formal presentation of research. It is possible to over indulge—centralizing the gaze inward in a manner of self-absorption that overshadows research aims and mystifies research findings. This problem, for instance, sits at the core of Oyeronke Oyewumi’s (2003b) ardent critique of Alice Walker’s campaign against female circumcision in Africa, reflected in the latter’s Warrior Marks (1996, co-authored with Pratibha Parmar) and Possessing the Secret of Joy (1993). Oyewumi argues that Walker utilizes a Westernized, self-centred, self-absorbed, and overly personalized filter through which she interprets Africa and Africans for a larger Western audience. (One might say that Walker could have worked out her underlying and personal motivating factors for the books through another medium before making raw, and arguably, unexamined emotion the basis of her insights into the subject of genital cutting among Africans.) Access to expressive outlets for raw emotion, melancholy, and nostalgia—in the form of the journal, narrative, poems, and painting—is important to the productive negotiation of such conditions (Akhtar 1999; Volkan 1999). Furthermore, privacy in this process enables a critical thinking-through, free of the constraining anxiety of the judgment of others. Nostalgic sentiments have traditionally occupied the realm of the illogical, an interpretation that does not leave the sentiment in a position to be easily reconciled to and unpacked within the disciplinary writing standards of a formal research presentation. Yet neglecting and suppressing nostalgia in the process of conducting research is likely to affect the research process in ways that work against the thoughtful transparency that feminist self-reflexivity encourages.

In the context of my fieldwork in South Africa, poetry served the therapeutic
function of expressing what existentialist philosopher Jean-Paul Sartre and novelist Tsitsi Dangarembga have elaborated as the “nervous condition” (Dangarembga 1988/2004; Sartre 1963/2004), a condition produced by the reality of multiplicity in the company of colonization and alongside various forms of marginalization and alienation among the historically colonized. Reflecting on insider/outsider status from this vantage point highlights power as an ongoing site of negotiation for the “third world” expatriate researcher returning home, and the nostalgic sentiment in research as productive to the extent that it gives way to thoughtful considerations of the ever-shifting configurations of identity.

Thinking of Home

When I arrive, I am relieved.
Warmed by the familiarity of what surrounds.
The jovial airport staff greeting one another above the rolling heads of focused travelers.
The biltong stand, the eager taxi drivers;
the intonations, cadences, gestures…
My ears vibrate, the heart is warmed.
Everything is beautiful,
and, I am home.

Nostalgia, or mal du pays, is a term attributed to seventeenth-century Swiss physician Johannes Hofer, who used the term in diagnosing a profound melancholia and “pining for home” among Swiss soldiers in the service of European armies (Wildschut et al. 2008). Nostalgia may be understood as an effect of the pain, sadness, or mourning that accompanies the desire to return to an original home (Wildschut et al. 2008; Volkan 1999), and, according to psychiatrist Salman Akhtar, as “a retrospective idealization of lost objects” (1999, 123). Akhtar points out that the transition from one country to another often involves “profound losses,” which may include “familiar food, native music, unquestioned social customs, known history, and…even one’s attire and language.” (1999, 123). He further notes that in the new country of residence “the individual is faced with strange tasting food, different music, new political concerns, cumbersome language, pale festivals, psychically unearned history, and visually unfriendly landscape” (1999, 123). It is possible to speculate on the arguable solace that ethnic enclaves in new geographies of residence provide to newcomers, but these communities are more likely to nurture a communal gaze towards the original home than to eliminate the nostalgic sentiment, since “cultural artifacts from ‘back home’ and pieces of native music” along with culturally specific events often serve to “evoke…aching pride and affection” in immigrants (Akhtar 1999, 125).

The nostalgic effect has been described as a “historical emotion” (Tageldin 2003, 235), a state of present fixation with past loss. The sentiment has also been linked to the alienation and discrimination of immigrants in adoptive countries, to the extent that nostalgia functions to compensate for such experiences and serves as a coping mechanism in the face of existential threat (Wildschut et al. 2008). To this end, nostalgia sustains a sense of self-worth and value in the yearner through sentimental links to the notion of original belonging and cultural specificity. The work of psychiatrist Vamik Volkan (1999) suggests that, in the context of nostalgic expression, poetry can act as a linking object, creating a common meeting ground between the mourner and the perceived loss. This creative meeting ground often represents a critical effort on the part of the mourner to come to terms with and assess the condition of multiple belonging (Kandiyoti 2003). Volkan views the creative use of linking objects—for example, poetry, sculpture, painting, or a novel—as representative of an effort to connect “the lost persons, things, locations, or culture with efforts to give them up, bury them, and move on” (1999, 176). Creative expressions of nostalgia are generally encouraged in the realm of psychoanalysis (Akhtar 1999; Volkan 1999) because of their capacity to lead mourners into critical rather than wholly romantic engagements with dislocation. This “healthy” nostalgia (Volkan 1999, 178) is contrasted to its pathological version, characterized by the inability of nostalgics to live free of existential anxiety in their present environment—or, in effect, a failure to live well in the present due to a romantic
fixation on an authentic home and past elsewhere.

Post-colonial and cultural theory, literary criticism, and philosophy (Appiah 1991, 1993; Gilroy 1993, 2000; wa Thiong’o 1985, among others) are replete with analyses of the attempts of diasporic peoples to reconcile belonging, alienation, and longing, particularly in the context of the question “What and where is home?” The romantically inclined nostalgic subject of psychiatric literature is likely to answer this question in cliché form: “Home is where the heart is.” As literary scholar Dalia Kandiyoti suggests with reference to the American context, “In diaspora, under conditions of social oppression, it is often difficult to resist the imaginative construction of home and homeland as a stable and welcoming place—one that offers continuity, reinstates cultural memory, and restores the wounds of racist ‘atrocities’” (2003). History, on the other hand, shows us that affective ties and original nationality are not necessarily the main factors constitutive of a sense of being “at home.” This, we may gauge, for instance, from the experiences of numerous African writers prevented from being at home in their respective countries of origin due to the state harassment and threat they face because of their work (Parker 1993). Literary scholar Kenneth Parker suggests that, in this case, the space in which “the writer finds refuge … [and] satisfaction in the task of writing” is a space the writer can to some extent be “at home in” (1993, 67). In other words, the thinker’s home is not necessarily where the heart is, nor solely identified with the geographic object of nostalgic longing. We may just as well accept home as the place that allows the thinker to, in actuality, think and write in relative liberty. In this vein, Parker posits the politics that exile African intellectuals in the name of cultural authenticity as turning the place of origin into a home where the heart is coerced into falsehood.

Despite these dynamics, there continues to be a profound commitment to identifying with and writing “original” homes among African intellectuals residing outside the continent. Ngugi wa Thiong’o, for his part, decided in the late 1970s to rely exclusively on his native Gikuyu language for the writing of future novels (wa Thiong’o 2005). This political bid for cultural preservation runs counter to another approach to questions of African identity and cultural valuation, one that embraces a global cosmopolitanism best enunciated in the work of philosopher Kwame Anthony Appiah. Appiah acknowledges that “in the global system of cultural exchanges there are…somewhat asymmetrical processes of homogenization going on, and [that] there are forms of human life disappearing” (1997, 619). He, nonetheless, presents the optimistic view that, “as forms of culture disappear, new forms are created, and they are created locally, which means they have exactly the regional inflections that the cosmopolitan celebrates” (1997, 619). This stands in some tension with Ngugi wa Thiong’o’s concerned deliberations about the harmful role of European languages and epistemological frameworks in imposing themselves as memory upon the psyches of Africans (wa Thiong’o 2005). He explains this as a process by which European ontology and epistemology supplant autochthonous African knowledge of the self in the realm of the social, placing Europe as the primary point of reference for indigenous Africans in their articulation of their own existence and reality.

Politicized in this sense, home resonates as the familiar and familial site of one’s naming, as a sense of ownership and authentic participation in cultural evolution, as a place of intergenerational history and established roots, as well as a place of mutual recognition in the context of socio-cultural intimacy. The nostalgic undercurrents of Ngugi wa Thiong’o’s fiction betray a recuperative impulse that may be readily critiqued for its bend towards the romantic exaltation of an uncorrupted culture in the past, but these nostalgic undercurrents also, and to a much greater extent, sustain an effective socialist and anti-colonial critique of multiple forms of neo-colonial alienation in the present. The circumstances surrounding Ngugi wa Thiong’o’s exile (his harassment and imprisonment by the Kenyan state) support literary scholar Shaden Tageldin’s assertion that “the home for which the exiled subject might (under normal conditions) long becomes, under the
imprint of colonial history, already a site of dispossession, a home whose residents cannot feel at home" (2003, 233). Nonetheless, Ngugi wa Thiong'o's committed intellectual gestures towards Kenya as home attest to the effectiveness of creative expression in critically illuminating a state of missing home, while being psychologically, if not physically, there. This is the state that I surmised in relation to my fieldwork poetry—the melancholia of unidealized yearning in the very presence of the object.

Turning in more detail to the fieldwork trip itself, we may ponder the productive uses to which this nostalgic melancholy may be directed in the context of a research journey home to the site of yearning. In line with a common disclosure in feminist anecdotes on methods and insider/outsider dynamics, class and education distinguished me from the subjects of my archival research and from many of the residents in the neighbourhoods that acted as a residential base over the duration of my fieldwork. Yet geographic and cultural familiarity, family connections, and, arguably, a shared political history, provided me with the kind of cultural literacy often attributed to “insiders.” Not surprisingly, the issue of foreignness, privilege, and belonging came to pivot on the premise, purpose, and utility of my research, as well as on the extent of my efforts to come to terms with the complex layers of belonging and unbelonging in an ever changing South African milieu.

**Homeward Bound**

I am awkward in this familiar place. The new township cosmopolitanism has left me, and my Canadian notebook in the dust. This crisp July day in Soweto, I face the decaying family house. Vilakazi Street. Its political heroes now a distant memory for tourist consumption. Benz, Audis and BMWs conference in front of the restaurant at the top of the hill.

The aunts and cousins inside will ask: What brings you home this time?

I will not say I am paid to research the politics of their poverty, our history, the BMWs up the road—that, I must make some people in Canada very interested in this, so I can afford the trip home. I will say it was—time.

I stand at our broken electric gate, consider the bustle of the street—and taste my historical place under the weight of postcolonial moments.

I had come home to reconnect with and reread history, motivated by both personal memory and an ongoing engagement with the writing of African feminists concerned with the multiple vantage points from which feminist consciousness is constructed as foreign to the African continent. My research had a historical orientation directed at employing a close reading of existing South African scholarship and archival documents speaking to feminist agency among African women during the twentieth century. I analyzed grassroots forms of resistance as a means of going beyond the look to formal political organizations as the main indicators of political agency among women. As a result, I chose to analyze grassroots and day-to-day forms of politicized resistance among African women who worked as domestic servants, cleaners, factory workers, and subsistence farmers. I also examined primary and secondary sources documenting the lives of women who were engaged in multiple income-earning activities in the informal economy, such as beer brewing, laundry work, and food vending, as well as women who were unemployed for long periods of time. This focus was directed at highlighting diversity in the forms through which feminist consciousness manifested, as well as the meanings that framed African women’s resistance to the socially established boundaries of womanhood. My aim was to contribute to discussions that prompt critical assessments of the determinants of feminist consciousness. I viewed my work as
falling within the scope of a larger body of post-colonial and transnational feminist scholarship (Basu 1995; Grewal and Kaplan 1994; Jayawardena 1986; Mohanty 2003; Narayan 1997; Nzegwu 2001; Oyewumi 2003a, among others) that has questioned the presumptions often underlying what we come to know as “feminist,” and how we come to evaluate human agency. To this end, I pursued primary and secondary sources on African women’s collective actions as part of a theoretical examination of the women’s rights component in such activism.

I was motivated in large part by personal experience and observation. A formative part of my adolescence was spent in Southern Africa, often in the company of my maternal grandmother, who lived in the Orlando West section of the Soweto township in Johannesburg. I observed my grandmother head a cross-generational household of immediate and extended family members, and learned that she never married and had raised her nine sons on the meagre pay of a hospital cleaner. All of these boys had the benefit of a basic education thanks to her efforts. The memories that were particularly striking to me years later as a Women’s Studies student at a Canadian university were of her active women-centred social network. I thought of the weekly gatherings after church that took place in my grandmother’s home, where the lively banter among women also included more sober discussions on how to deal with abusive husbands and hide personal money—conversations that in another geographic, cultural, and historical context are easily situated along radical, liberal, and socialist feminist trajectories. This group’s commitment to a common savings scheme for the purpose of availing themselves of an emergency fund outside the purview of the inequitable dynamics that otherwise framed many of their daily experiences was reflective of their critical awareness that the prevailing parameters of womanhood necessitated efforts towards autonomy and collective solidarity.

Having taken for granted the fact that African women discuss, analyze, and organize around womanhood as an identity that calls for a critical accounting, I was disquieted in my studies by the frequency and confidence with which the anti-feminism of African women was implied, whether in the intellectual realm of International Development, Political Science, History, or Women’s Studies. Though African women have, indeed, over the course of the twentieth century been recorded as explicitly rejecting the label feminism as a descriptor of their political commitments, the resulting characterization of such objectors as anti-feminist too simplistically reinforced mistaken notions of African women as politically unenlightened and unsophisticated. This was contrary to what I knew. The majority of the foundational principles that I encountered as definitive of the term “feminist” in the North American context I had learned from African women and my seemingly apolitical Eastern European mother. It was on this basis that I eventually developed the research project that would place these tensions in a historical frame within the South African context.

Setting forth for “home,” this time as a researcher, conjured familiar anxieties related to power as a site of negotiation. Perceived foreignness or belonging either opens or closes certain research and collaborative possibilities, while the premise and motivation of one’s research do not change the fact that immediate personal benefit accrues in the context of the first-world university as a result of the temporary sojourn South. Travelling across three South African provinces while conducting archival research was a journey mired in the complexity of belonging and unbelonging. I travelled as a partially funded graduate student and the single mother of two toddlers; nonetheless, I was considered wealthy enough to have been able to afford the hefty airfare that my intellectual pursuits demanded—another Western researcher on a whimsical, self-serving exploration of the South. At other times, as with the head archivist at a university in the Eastern Cape, my family’s political history (some of which was found among the archived documents on site) facilitated a warm reception—he viewing my work as a continuation of the long-standing commitment of a number of my family members to liberation politics in the country. My own desire to articulate the dynamics of my
presence, travels, and interactions beyond the empiricism of the dissertation methods chapter gave way to poetry as an additional medium of expression.

The poetry journal enabled a critical self-reflexivity that the journal notes or methodology chapter of the final research report could not, on their own, accomplish. Poetry was useful in unpacking and mediating nostalgia in two key realms of the expatriate experience: the reality of being out of date (i.e., people, culture, “home” move on and change without us) and the reality of being a native foreigner—a compatriot whose “specialness” by virtue of residing in the West is a source of cautious suspicion, distance, exceptional hospitality, release from custom or unusual expectations to adhere to custom, among other factors. For instance, it is not unusual for family members in the homeland to test the “native foreigner’s” cultural authenticity through demands of adherence to cultural customs that many among them no longer observe. Deviation from my kinship and seniority-related role in the context of ongoing family disputes over property and money is the most common way in which my foreignness and Westernization is gauged by family during my stays in South Africa. That the basis of the disputes themselves are evidence of deviation on the part of the participants from the customs of kinship towards evolving state legislation and judicial law (in a sense, instruments of Euro-centred modernization) does not deter family members from strategically deploying the language and equation of “fixed custom=authenticity” as a measure of my cultural loyalties.

With each return, I am aware of being slightly out of touch; things have changed, evolved. To remain in-tune and honest demands a negotiation of this reality. I must set myself to learning the place of familiarity anew. This process begs expression. To ignore, suppress, or deny the ways that home constantly escapes is to risk becoming the tragic fossilized nostalgic, object of amusement and pity among family, friends, and observers who are living and creatively contributing to the regeneration of culture and society. It is this, to which poetry gives expression. The self-reflexive process through

The poetry journal also builds confidence in the interpretive and intuitive aspects of conducting research. In other words, I can trust myself, my questions, and what I see in the research process more as a result of poetically disrobing myself and wading through the untidy mess left on the floor. As a place of critical self-reflection, the poetry journal clarified the process of negotiating multiple belonging, aided in de-romanticizing my belonging and familiarity with “home,” and illuminated underlying motivations for pursuing the central research questions chosen.

Leaving Home for Home

Fort Hare

At dusk Alice smells a combination of patchouli, paint finish and musk. Orange peels litter the potholed roads and centre streets. The Victoria East Taxi Stand is silent. The produce vendors have packed up, and school children part once more with the orange peel trails that lead to their homes. Working women accompany each other in twos and threes homeward-bound.

I walk alone from the university arousing suspicion, curiosity. Gracious town folk are very worried, “everyone knows walking is for poors not Canadians.” Where to begin unraveling the untidiness of it all?

Poetry was one means by which I sought to come to terms with the tensions and realities of my presence and purpose on this trip to South Africa. As a product of the state of “missing home while there,” poetry facilitated the expression of the dissonance embedded in romantic acquiescence to the illusion of a lost cultural authenticity waiting to embrace one in its fold. The discord to which
the poetry gave expression exposes nostalgia as an ongoing negotiation of multi-locality, which itself is a circumstance that Appiah credits with nurturing the ground for a rooted cosmopolitanism—and the very point of roots here being that you can “take them with you” (1997, 618). What is clear, as the common thread among a myriad of critical public considerations of home and belonging attests, is that the state of “being at home” requires ongoing negotiation and critical assessment of the conditions of belonging.

As a symptom of immigrant nostalgia, the poetry I wrote aided the process of critically assessing the dynamics of insider/outside status surrounding my research. This is not altogether surprising given the complexity, intellectual and stylistic flexibility, and profound sentimentality to which poetry as an expressive form lends itself. As American poet Robert Frost aptly put it, poetry is, at its best, “language under pressure to the highest degree” (quoted in Bauer 2006, 31). In this sense, poetry is capable of carrying multiplicity and complexity in condensed form, ideally, allowing the nostalgic subject to transcend the romance in melancholia into more sober and productive assessments of belonging, alienation, privilege, and positionality. As part of a wider feminist assessment of ethics in the context of fieldwork and methodology, poetry served the purpose of providing a space within which to confront the more “emotional” politics of immigrant nostalgia framing the research project. As such, poetic expression formed a valuable part of the critical self-accounting called for in feminist methodology, while also providing an instructive position from which to consider questions of motivation, power, and privilege in transnational research.

Endnotes
1. My immigration to Canada in 1989 was framed by a combination of political and economic factors, but I was not a refugee. Therefore, I focus on literature pertaining to the immigrant experience in particular. I do not seek to extend the discussion of nostalgia as it appears here to claimants of refugee status, temporary migrants, and non-status residents.
2. There has been some small measure of debate over whether descriptive qualifiers such as “black,” “white,” and “Indian” should be tacked onto “African” in identifying people of the continent of Africa. Numerous “black” African intellectuals have lamented this as a problematic practice that attempts to reduce the irreducible and to de-indigenize Africans, imposing on Africans a U.S. paradigm that has created for blacks in America what W.E.B. Du Bois (1903) characterized as the double consciousness of hyphenated identity (African-American, black-American). Africans in Africa are the majority not the minority, and the communal African experience or what we may think of as the “African world” is shaped by this reality. The identity “African” remains open to a diversity of people who wish to claim it and figure out for themselves how they want to articulate that identity; this does not necessitate descendants of the indigenous ethnic groups of the continent to hyphenate their identities. The understanding I provide here is standard practice in African studies and the view is shared by many significant African critics and theorists: Wole Soyinka, Chinua Achebe, Ama Ata Aidoo. I should also note that we do not hear of white Canadian literature or white American literature. My writing reflects this particular positioning relative to such questions. In my research I only used the descriptor “black” with respect to women who were influenced by the Black Consciousness Movement in South Africa and its particular use of that term during the 1970s and 1980s (which drew some elements from U.S. Black Consciousness/Black Power), though this falls outside of the scope of what I discuss in this paper.

References


